PRESENTATION TO APPORDE

By Duma Gqubule

02 September 2020

NATIONAL VISION FOR GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT

- Mobilising vision and plan (China, Japan, South Korea, Ethiopia, Rwanda)
- State capacity to initiate growth and development
- High rates of capital formation (35% to 50%)
- Human Development (education and health)
- Industrial upgrading
- Social Policy (extend social security to WAP, job guarantee, basic income)
- Macro-economic policy (wider range of policy tools than Keynes)

  - ✓ **Multiple tools** (exchange rate, state control of finance, reserve requirements, capital controls, prescribed assets, credit quotas, differential interest rates)
  - ✓ **Multiple targets and objectives** (inflation, unemployment, growth, sectors)
  - ✓ Inflation targeting (one target, one tool) is primitive
  - ✓ Close co-ordination of monetary, fiscal and industrial policies
  - ✓ Implications for mandate and independence of central banks

South Africa economy (1987 - 1996)

	Bank Rate	Inflation	Real prime	GDP	GDP pc	Debt to GDP	Deficit to GDP	Deficit (Smith)
1987	9.5	16.2	(1.94)	2.1	(0.1)	30.1	4.4	
1988	14.5	12.8	4.85	4.2	2.0	31.6	5.0	
1989	18.0	14.7	4.90	2.4	0.2	31.3	3.5	
1990	18.0	14.3	5.56	(0.3)	(2.6)	31.4	1.4	Surplus
1991	17.0	15.3	3.48	(1.0)	(3.4)	31.8	1.9	Balance
1992	14.0	14.0	6.97	(2.1)	(4.6)	33.2	3.7	2.4
1993	12.0	9.7	5.25	1.2	(1.3)	38.1	7.3	4.9
1994	13.0	8.9	5.79	3.2	0.8	43.0	5.6	2.9
1995	15.0	8.7	8.53	3.1	1.0	48.3	4.6	
1996	17.0	7.3	11.3	4.3	2.4	49.5	5.1	

R50bn to PIC/GEPF

R14 billion Forex losses at SARB

SOUTH AFRICA ECONOMY (1994 - 2019)

	GDP	GDP pc	Comments
1994 - 2019	2.7	1..0	GDP per capita 28.1% higher in 2019 than in 1994 (China 760% and India 300% over same period)
1996 - 2003	2.6	0.9	Slash and burn fiscal policies (cuts in capital spending) Sky high interest rates 15% – 21.85% (May to Aug 1998) **Unemployment doubled to 8m (40.6%) in March 2003 from 4.m (29% in 1995)**
2004 - 2008	4.8	3.2	World equities and commodity boom Expansionary monetary and fiscal policies. Interest rates dropped 650 basis points to 7% in June 2003. Government spending increased Investment to 23.5% in 2008 from 16% in 2003 **Jobs up 3.1m to 14.8m in December 2008 from 11.7m in March 2003. Unemployment rate fell to 28.7% from 40.6%**
2009 – 2019	1.4	0.1	**Lost Decade of Economic Development** Failure to recover from global financial crisis (China and Ethiopia economies trebled in seize over same period)

WORLD GDP GROWTH (2009 – 2019)

SA underperformed all developing regions in world by large margin. Low growth is not due to global factors. Now a decade since the global crisis. Cant be used as excuse for SA low growth

Region	**2009**	**2010**	**2011**	**2012**	**2013**	**2014**	**2015**	**2016**	**2017**	**2018**	**2019**	**Ave**
World	(0.1)	5.4	4.2	3.5	3.4	3.5	3.4	3.1	3.8	3.7	2.9	**3.3**
Emerging Market & Dev. Economies (153)	2.9	7.4	6.3	5.4	5.1	4.7	4.2	4.1	4.7	4.6	3.7	**4.8**
Emerging & Dev. Asia (30)	7.5	9.6	7.9	7.0	6.9	6.8	6.7	6.4	6.5	6.5	5.6	**7.0**
Sub-Saharan Africa (45)	3.9	7.0	5.0	4.3	5.3	5.1	3.4	1.4	2.9	2.9	3.3	**4.0**
Middle East & Central Asia (31)			4.6	4.9	3.0	3.1	2.6	5.0	2.3.	1.9	0.9	**3.1**
Emerging & Developing Europe (12)	(3.0)	4.6	6.5	2.4	4.9	3.9	4.7	3.2	6.0	3.8	1.8	**3.5**
Latin America & the Caribbean (22)	(1.8)	6.1	4.7	3.0	2.9	1.2	0.1	(1.0)	1.3	1.1	0.1	**1.6**
South Africa	**(1.5)**	**3.0**	**3.3**	**2.2**	**2.5**	**1.8**	**1.3**	**0.6**	**1.3**	**0.8**	**0.4**	**1.4**
South Africa (pc)	**(2.7)**	**1.9**	**2.1**	**1.0**	**1.2**	**0.4**	**(0.1)**	**(0.8)**	**(0.1)**	**(0.4)**	**(1.1)**	**0.1**

CRISIS BEFORE THE CRISIS

Crisis of collapsing GDP growth and rising unemployment

- Unemployment increased by 4.9m since Dec 2008

- 10.8m unemployed
  - 44% for black Africans
  - 48% for black African females
  - 49% in Eastern Cape

- 64% poverty rate Black Africans (2015, Stats SA)

- Most unequal country in the world – Gini 0.63 (income) and 0.95 (income)

- Five years of declining GDP per capita (2015 – 2019)

- Two recessions on two years (2018 & 2019)

- Three consecutive quarters of declining GDP by March 2020 (Before Covid) and was heading for third recession in three years (2020)

- 6 out of 9 quarters of declining GDP. 7 out of 9 quarters of declining investment despite 3 summits were huge pledges were made

THE CURRENT CRISIS (March 2020- present)

Fourth phase of post-apartheid economy

- Witnessing shocks of crisis that could eviscerate the dreams of our liberation.
- Crony corona capitalism and vulgar neoliberalism – obsession with inflation targets, irrelevant structural reforms and unprecedented austerity of R600bn - will deepen the depression and result in three years of declining GDP.
- Unemployment increased by three million between February and April 2020 and two million were women (NIDS-CRAM Survey)
- Unemployment heading towards 50% at which point whole society will be unviable. The social fabric will be irreversibly scarred
- Could take five years to reach 2019 levels of GDP (UNDP)
- The collateral damage could be with us for the next decade (NIDS CRAM)

STIMULUS PACKAGE (PRESIDENT RAMAPHOSA 21 APRIL)

Item	Above the line (On-budget)	Below the line (Off-budget)	Total
Loan Guarantee		200	
UIF		40	
Job Creation and SMEs	100		
Tax Measures	70		
Grant	50		
Public Health	20		
Municipalities	20		
Total	**260**	**240**	**500** (10% of GDP)

STIMULUS PACKAGE (SUPPLEMENTARY BUDGET: 24 JUNE)

Item	Above the line President	Above the Line (Supplementary Budget)	
Job creation and SMEs	100	6.1	No explanation how it would be spent
Tax Measures	70	24	44 billion tax deferrals
Total	**260 (5.1% of GDP)**	**36 billion (0.7% of GDP)**	

R260 billion cuts including R161 billion reductions in wage bill and R100 billion from allocations to provincial and local government (February Budget)

R101 billion budget cuts (June budget)

R250 billion austerity measures (tax increases and budget cuts) for 2022 and 2023

R600 billion austerity will result in unprecedented three years of declining GDP

STIMULUS PACKAGE: SUPPLEMENTARY BUDGET: JUNE 24)

Item	Above the line (On-budget)	Below the line (Off-budget)	Total
Loan Guarantee		100	not really a stimulus R13.6 billion loans awarded No additionality PSCE falling
UIF		40	Disbursed R40 billion to 9.1 m employees
Total	**36 (0.7% of GDP)** Based on Covid expendure of R145 billion and R109 billion cuts	**140 (2.7% of GDP)**	**176 (3.5% of GDP)**

STIMULUS PACKAGE: SUPPLEMENTARY BUDGET: JUNE 24)

Item	Above the line (On-budget)	Below the line (Off-budget)	Total
UIF		40	Disbursed R40 billion to 9.1 m employees
Total	**16.4 billion (0.3% of GDP)** Covid allocations of R125.4bn (excl R19.6bn provisional allocations) allocation and R109 billion cuts Government only spent R18bn between April and August (15% of 122.4bn allocation)	**40 (0,8% of GDP)**	**56.5 (1.1% of GDP)**

DEBT TO GDP RATIOS

REGION OR COUNTRY	DEBT TO GDP
World	82.9
Advanced economies	103.6
Emerging and Middle Income	53.4
India	69.8
Brazil	87.9
Argentina	86.3
Pakistan	72.1
Egypt	92.6
Angola	80.5
Mozambique	110.5
South Africa (Gross) March 2020	63.5
South Africa (Net) March 2020	58.4

SA INC. BALANCE SHEET

LIABILITIES	
Net Loan debt	R2.9 trillion
Eskom	R454bn
RAF	R242bn
ASSETS	
PIC	R2 trillion
SARB Foreign Exchange Reserves	R1 trillion
Cash Balances	R260 billion

Trevor Manuel on Public Investment Corporation

It is important to note that the PIC makes investments predominantly on behalf of the Government Employees Pension Fund (GEPF).

Given that the GEPF is a defined benefit fund, it would be inappropriate to consider any returns accruing from such investments to be benefiting the beneficiaries. This is simply because the pension benefits are predetermined.

Such investments are essential to the extent that the employer [government] is able to meet its obligations to employees."

Today's Trustee, March 2005

Public Investment Corporation

Two ways of funding pensions

- ❑ **Pre-Funding (Fully Funded)**
  - ✓ Companies can go bankrupt so must be able to pay all pensions on the same day in the event that they close shop
  - ✓ PIC 108% funded. Obscene level of funding in country with high poverty compared with 90% target. Excess funding of R300bn
- ❑ **Pay-As-You-Go (PAYG)**
  - ✓ No scenario in which government can close shop and have to pay all 1.3m pensioners on the same day
  - ✓ Will always be teachers, nurses and policemen
  - ✓ Internationally, most government pension funds are not funded or partially funded
  - ✓ In SA, PIC was PAYG until late 1980s.

Public Investment Corporation

Two ways of designing pension funds

- ❑ **Defined Benefit**
  - ✓ Percentage of final salary and years of service
  - ✓ Workers do not benefit or loose if share price increases or decreases
  - ✓ Benefits specified upfront not related to contribution or fund performance
- ❑ **Defined contribution**
  - ✓ Based on contributions and performance of the fund

PIC ASSETS (Status Quo: Fully Funded)

	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
Revenue							
Employer Contributions	30.8	33.5	36.1	38.6	42.1	45.3	48.7
Employee Contributions	17.1	18.7	20.3	21.7	23.4	25.1	26.9
Total Contributions	**47.9**	**52.2**	**56.4**	**60.3**	**65.5**	**70.4**	**75.6**
Investment Income	49.9	54.0	68.5	69.0	69.5	72.0	84.2
Total Revenue	97.8	106.2	124.9	129.3	135.0	142.4	159.8
Total Expenditure	43.2	57.9	85.8	83.1	88.3	94.9	102.5
Surplus	**54.6**	**48.3**	**39.1**	**46.2**	**46.7**	**47.5**	**57.3**

PIC ASSETS (50% Investment Income)

	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
Revenue							
Employer Contributions	30.8	33.5	36.1	38.6	42.1	45.3	48.7
Employee Contributions	17.1	18.7	20.3	21.7	23.4	25.1	26.9
Total Contributions	**47.9**	**52.2**	**56.4**	**60.3**	**65.5**	**70.4**	**75.6**
Investment Income	25.0	27.0	34.3	34.5	34.8	36.0	42.1
Total Revenue	72.9	79.2	90.7	94.8	100.3	106.4	117.7
Total Expenditure	43.2	57.9	85.8	83.1	88.3	94.9	102.5
Surplus	**29.7**	**21.3**	**4.9**	**11.7**	**12.0**	**11.5**	**15.2**

SA Inc. OPTIONS

Reserve Bank

- Cut interest rates by 275 basis points
- Purchase government debt
  - Secondary market (SARB limited QE has bossed bond market and reduced cost of capital)

SA Inc. OPTIONS

Reserve Bank

- A sovereign state which issues its own currency cannot fail to meet its obligations in its own currency unless it chooses to do so – unique privilege that 90% of debt is domestic

- R1 trillion foreign exchange Reserves
  - One year of forecast imports (Nedbank) imports vs benchmark of three months
  - Can release R500 billion

- Recapitalise DFIs: IDC, Land Bank, SEFA (R100bn)

- Developmental windows – for banks to lend to priority sectors

- Monetary finance – financing of Eskom debt and government spending

SA Inc. OPTIONS

2. Reduce PIC funding to 50%

- Write off state debt of R500bn
- Write off SOC debt, including Eskom debt, of R200bn
- Use cash of R140bn to fund fiscal stimulus and convert assets into infrastructure

Release of assets of R840 billion from PIC

SA Inc. OPTIONS

3. Investment For Growth Accord (Prescribed Assets)

- R9 trillion industry assets (R6 trillion excluding Collective Investment Schemes).
- Investment for Growth Accord or Prescribed Assets
- 10% of industry assets towards developmental investments
- Must not be used to finance Eskom and SAA debt
  - Cannot finance past investments (that do not create a single job)
  - Can finance primary (as opposed to secondary) investments that create jobs - eg Eskom IPP projects

PROPOSED COVID-19 STIMULUS PACKAGE

	Stabilisation (12 - 18 months) (R billion)	Recovery (3 years) (R billion)
PIC (Debt write-off)	700	
PIC Cash	150	
Foreign Exchange Reserves	500	
Investment Accord [1]	150	350
SARB and PIC bond purchases		
SARB Developmental windows Recapitalise DFIs Monetary Finance		
TOTAL	**R 750 billion** **(before starting to print money)**	

1. **Investment for Growth accord with institutional investors (Prescribed Assets or S28**)

STIMULUS COMPONENTS

Dignity Floor below which no South African will fall

- ❑ BIG at Upper Poverty Line (R1227) will cost R500 billion
  - ✓ Must look at net cost after taking into account benefits of higher growth and tax revenues
  - ✓ Can implement taxes on wealth, property, carbon emissions, financial transactions
- ❑ Repurpose UIF to adopt German Kurzarbeit model
- ❑ Must implement NHI. Will cost R300 billion a year to reach two-thirds of per capita private sector expenditure
- ❑ Free Education (basic and tertiary) 300 000 teachers almost double the classrooms
- ❑ Green New Deal for South Africa to drive infrastructure spend and industrialisaton